

G-12(18)/94-NGD pages 01-06
(Notes i pages 01-06
(N संबद्ध फाइलें :---Connected Files :-Subject: Disappoarance of Notap Subject: Sabhash Chowdra Bost 1 No. 870/11/8/10/93-Pol (2) No. G-4(2)/95-NGO (3) No. G-16(3)/95-NGO (4) No. G-12(3)/98-NGO किस तारील को निकाली गई किस क्रमसंख्या के लिए निकाली गई टिप्पणी किस क्रम सं० निपटान हुआ Remarks Disposal Serial No. For Serial No. B/F Date 306/15/10/ 5/95 7, le outure

6-12(18)/94-1120

Internal

Controversy regarding Netaji's death and bringing his ashes to India from Japan.

In Pol. Socia

Home Secretary had written to Principal Secretary on 20.4.1994 on the above subject and had indicated that this matter would be placed before the Core Group for evolving a strategy.

- MEA has forwarded the minutes of the meeting of the Core 2. Group held on July 20. The Core Group discussed the articles published in Moscow alleging that Netaji was a MI-6 agent, and also that Netaji's birth centenary is due in 1997and the Bose Academy in Japan has taken the stand that the GOI should take over Netaji's ashes lying in the Renkoji temple in Tokyo.
- 3. The Core Group concluded :
 - As far as the articles are concerned recognising the sensitivity of even a suggestion of links between Netaji and the MI-6, prudence demands GOI's response on this issue should be minimal, as the articles had been almost unnoticed;
 - ii) As regards the question of taking possession of the ashes, no political advantage lay in decision at this juncture since Netaji's birth centenary is due in 1997. A view could be taken later, at the beginning of 1996-97.
 - iii) It was felt that very little publicity should be given to this issue and it may not be necessary to place it before the Cabinet. The Core Group felt may be apprised accordingly, and directions obtained.

Luyala Mehla (Sujata Mehta) Director 26.8.1994

1 2 m/8/14 Principal Secretary

Me hopic behind the decision/suggestion

See the ashes. Please prepare a note for

Shaining directions of Policy

Principal Secretary

Principal Secretary JS(M) - (on tour) P. M. O. INGON By No 354/73/94 34-8-94

Subject:

Controversy regarding Netaji's death and bringing his ashes to India from Japan.

- 1. In December 1993 EAM had drawn PM's attention to the need to constitute a high-level group which would look into the various issues concerning Netaji's death, and bringing his ashes to India from Japan.
- 2. The matter regarding Netaji's death and the proposal to bring his ashes to India was last considered by the CCPA in January 1991 and the view taken at that time was that no purpose would be served by holding another inquiry into the death of the Netaji, or by bringing back his ashes to India.
- 3. In the second half of 1993 reports were received from our Embassy in Moscow about articles published in a Russian journal, based on classified KGB archives, alleging inter alia that Netaji was an MI-6 agent. The articles went almost unnoticed.
- 4. At about the same time our Embassy in Tokyo had reported the possibility of the new Chief Priest of the Renkoji temple in Japan where Netaji's ashes lie, asking our Embassy in Tokyo to take over the ashes.
- 5. Keeping these factors in view, MEA had proposed the possibility of trying to create a consensus in favour of bringing the ashes to India, possibly through constituting a National Committee to commemorate Netaji's birth centenary in 1997.
- 6. MHA was asked to look into this matter and to prepare a paper for the Cabinet.
- 7. The matter was placed before the Core Group by MHA. The

 Core Group discussed this subject on July 20 and considered two
 aspects the articles published in Moscow, as well as the fact
 that Netaji's birth centenary is due in 1997 and that the Bose

Academy in Japan may ask the GOI to take over the ashes.

8. The Core Group's conclusions were -

C-15/18/61-400

- i) In regard to the articles in the Russian journal, recognising the sensitivity of even a suggestion of links between Netaji and the MI-6, prudence demands GOI's response on this issue should be minimal, as the articles had gone almost unnoticed;
- ii) As regards the question of taking possession of the ashes, no political advantage lay in a decision at this juncture since Netaji's birth centenary is due in 1997. A view could be taken later at the beginning of 1996-97.
- iii) It was also felt that very little publicity should be given to this issue and it may not be necessary to place it before the Cabinet. The Core Group felt PM may be apprised accordingly, and his directions obtained.
- 9. With reference to the recommendation of the Core Group about Netaji's ashes, it is for consideration that the matter cannot be seen only in terms of political advantage as the decision may not lie wholly with us. Our Embassy in Tokyo had reported the possibility of a request from the Japanese side to take over the ashes as Netaji's associates, the members of the Bose Academy, are ageing and their continued custody of the ashes cannot be depended on. In the event of such a request we would have to be prepared to respond. Further, as Netaji's birth centenary approaches (in 1997), the different aspects of the issue are likely to attract greater public attention.
- 10. To give further thought to this subject the possible options that could be considered include:
 - i) Setting up a high-level group chaired by PM, proposed by EAM;

- ii) consideration of this matter by the Cabinet on the basis of a paper to be prepared by MHA as had been recommended in October, 1993;
 - iii) setting up of a Group of Ministers to consider this subject, whose recommendations could then be considered by the Cabinet;
 - iv) no further action on bringing the matter to the Cabinet for the present, as suggested by the Core Group;
 - 11. In view of the circumstances and reasons mentioned in paragraphs 3, 4 and 9 above it is for consideration that as indicated earlier, MHA could prepare a paper for the Cabinet on this subject.

Lugala Mehla (Sujata Mehta) Director 2.9.94

JSM Core group's reconvered at on the this mostle.

Sight Severe with recontaction and and the this mostle.

Assure with recontaction while it is being considered.

Assure with recontaction while it is being considered.

PM'S instructions could be solicited on the Core

954 JSW 95 94 18884

MOS IPMO'S OFFICE

DY NO. 162-TS

OATE 13/994

320/73 (hospital the Great for the Group's reconversation at 8 (ii) whose

PM No. 15/994

The Great form the description of the colors in the color of the Great that there is a great in the color of the Great that there is a great in the color of the Great that there is a great in the color of the Great that there is a great in the color of the Great that there is a great in the color of the color of

TOP SECRET

Principal Secretary had received a letter in August 1994 from Shri Ashis C. Ray in August this year about some aspects relating to the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose which he feels are not adequately explained.

- 2. MEA has conveyed the following position on the issues mentioned by Shri Ray:
 - i) An explanation is necessary from Japanese authorities about why the cremation certificate was not in Netaji's name;

MEA has no direct information on this. The Japanese Foreign Office had conveyed in 1956 that the cremation permit assumed to be that of Netaji "must correspond to the case for late Mr. Subhas Chandra Bose." The Cabinet accepted the conclusions of the two enquiry committees of 1956 (Shah Nawaz) and 1970 (Khosla) which had concluded that Netaji died in the air crash in August 1945. The Khosla Commission report was tabled in Parliament on 3.9.1974.

ii) In 1956 the Japanese investigated and confirmed the death of Netaji; a copy of the Japanese report was made available to Government.

MEA does not have have such a document.

iii) Information should be sought from Russian authorities about Netaji's visit to the Soviet Union after August 18, 1945.

The Russian Federation had confirmed to our Embassy in Moscow in January 1992 that they have no information about the stay of Netaji Bose in the Soviet Union during or following 1945.

391/73/h. Secy wordy

iv) The British Government should clarify its stand upto the late 1940's that Netaji did not die in the plane crash.

There is nothing relating to this in MEA's record.

The urn containing the ashes of Netaji should be Xrayed to determine that it contains Netaji's gold plated tooth.

There are some discrepancies about the dates on which the ashes were seen by Col. Habibur Rahman, Netaji's ADC. His two separate depositions refer to a small piece of gold being seen among the ashes.

vi) Shri Ray had referred to the possibility of seeking the Supreme Court's orders authorising return of the ashes.

MEA has no record pertaining to such an application.

- In February 1991 the CCPA had approved that "no useful purpose would be served by holding yet another inquiry or by bringing the ashes back to India at present ". Subsequently in August 1992 PM had approved that the inquiry into the question of whether Netaji is dead or alive or the circumstances of his disappearance need not be reopened.
- In September 1994, PM had directed MHA to bring a paper for Cabinet's consideration on the controversy about Netaji's death and bringing his ashes to India, keeping in view Netaji's birth centenary would fall in 1997.

Submitted for information.

211 Dis(5) TS184

JS(M)

215/Divasky Dr. No. 459/194

Sujala Meble (Sujata Mehta) Director

पत्राचार CCRRESPONDENCE

Sl. Nos.: 01 - 04 Pages: 01 - 13 SMO (1)

TOP SECRET

Ministry of External Affairs Joint Secretary(AP)'s Office

P.M.O. may please refer to their U.O. No.870/11/P/10/93-Pol dated 9 August, 1994 regarding Netaji.

Foreign Secretary has directed that a copy of TS note No.89/2/1/94-TS dated 22 July 1994 about Netaji's death be sent to you for information.

Grant Total Y

(R.S. Kalha) Joint Secretary(AP)

Ms Sujata Mehta, Director(PMO)

MEA u.o. No. 29276JS(A)/94 dt. 22.8.1994 No. 25/14/NGO

Please huch

Rise Port.

Rol. See. Film is put up 1.

Mais

P. N. O. (NGO)

Dy. No 354 1794

Date 24-8-94

142/ Dir (5) (TS) 94 241894

T-500/P5/9

Privileg daines 7-3091/260194

TOP SECRET

IMMEDIATE

COPY NO. 1 - 3/2

No. 89/2/1/94-TS
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA(BHARAT SARKAR)
CABINET SECRETARIAT(MANTRIMANDAL SACHIVALAYA)
RASHTRAPATI BHAVAN

New Delhi, the 22nd July, 1994.

Subject:- Controversy about Netaji's death and allegations that he was an MI-6 Agent.

Record note of discussion of the meeting held at 3.00 P.M. on 20th July, 1994, in the Committee Room, Cabinet Secretariat, Rashtrapati Bhavan, New Delhi, on the above subject, is given below:-

"It was noted that in the context of:

- (i) A series of articles published in Moscow in the magazine "Asia and Africa Today" alleging that Netaji was an MI-6 agent;
- (ii) Netaji's birth centenary due in 1997 and the stand taken by the Bose Academy in Japan that the GOI should take possession of the mortal remains of Netaji;

the Prime Minister Office had asked MHA to prepare a paper for the Cabinet.

- 2. During the course of discussions, it was observed that:
- (a) the publication of the Articles had attracted very little media attention so far;
- (b) the publication had taken place in a magazine whose circulation was dwindling rapidly;
- (c) on account of the efforts made by MEA, the Articles had not been translated or re-printed;
- (d) apart from containing the allegation that Netaji was secretly assisting the MI-6, the Articles by themselves were not derogatory;
- (e) as considerable time had elapsed since these Articles appeared (during the period August - October, 1993) and thus far had evoked no media interest, it was very unlikely that these would appear in the Indian media in the future;
- (f) the Bose Academy had not issued an ultimatum regarding the handing over of the ashes but merely made a representation on the grounds that its members were rapidly aging and may not be able to discharge their present duties.
- (g) the GOI was paying for the upkeep of the mortal remains in Renkoji temple and the management could be persuaded to continue with this arrangement if the upkeep charges were increased.

- 3. The following conclusions were arrived at:
- (i) Since the Articles had not attracted any media attention so far, it was unlikely that such a contingency would arise in the future. Even in the unlikely event of these Articles appearing in the local media, its ripple effects were likely to be minimal since the basic thrust of the Articles did appear to project Netaji in a patriotic light as an opponent of fascism. However, some sensitivity did attach in this very suggestion of an association presumably even if falls such as Netaji with MI-6. Prudence demanded therefore that GOI response on this issue should be minimal and as low key as possible. In fact, the issue is best left alone and if possible, allowed to be forgotten.
- (ii) As regards the question of taking possession of the ashes was concerned, no particular advantage lay in taking a decision on this at this juncture since the birth centenary celebrations were due only in 1997. Therefore, a view could be taken in the matter in 1996-97 and till such time status quo should be maintained. The temple management may be persuaded to continue with the upkeep of the ashes and, if necessary, the maintenance charges being paid to the temple may be suitably increased to meet the increased cost.
- (iii) Since it was best that as little publicity as possible was given to the entire issue, it was felt that it may not be necessary to place this matter before the Cabinet. PM may be apprised accordingly and his directions obtained.

Sd/-(P.P. Prabhu) Additional Secretary.

To

Shri K. Padmanabhaiah, Home Secretary.

Copy endorsed to Shri K. Srinivasan, Foreign Secretary.

(Sanjiv Misra) Joint Secretary. 18.8.1994.

TOP SECRET

TOP SECRET Copy No. 1/2

MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

Sub.: Controversy regarding Netaji's death and bringing his ashes to India from Japan.

Principal Secretary to Prime Minister may please refer to his UO No.870/11/P/10/93-Pol. dated the 13th October, 1993 and this Ministry's UO of even number dated 20th April, 1994 on the above subject.

- The matter was placed before the Committee of Secretaries which discussed it in its meeting held on 20th July, 1994. After deliberations, it arrived at the following conclusions:
 - (i) Since the Articles had not attracted any media attention so far, it was unlikely that such a contingency would arise in the future. Even in the unlikely event of these Articles appearing in the local media, its ripple effects were likely to be minimal since the basic thrust of the Articles did appear to project Netaji in a patriotic light as an opponent of fascism. However, some sensitivity did attach in this very suggestion of an association - presumably even if false - such as Netaji with MI-6. Prudence demanded, therefore, that response on this issue should be minimal and as low key as possible. In fact, the issue is best left alone and if possible, allowed to be forgotten.

As regards the question of taking possession of the ashes was concerned, no particular advantage lay in taking a decision on this at this juncture since the birth centenary celebrations were due only in 1997. Therefore, a view could be taken in the matter in 1996-97 and till such time status quo should be maintained. The temple management may be persuaded to continue with the upkeep of the ashes and, if necessary, the maintenance charges being paid to the temple may be

Since it was best that as little publicity as possible was given to the entire issue, it was felt that it may not be necessary to place this matter before the Cabinet. PM may be apprised

suitably increased to meet the increased cost.

(iii)

C12/18/94-Was

246-TS/JS(N)/94 30.5.94 169/04/05/TS/94 2-9-94 11-894, N. M. (NGO)/359/T/94 TOP SECRET

Contd 2/-

-: 2 :-

accordingly and his directions obtained.

3. PM may kindly be apprised of this for his directions.

(K. PADMANABHAIAH)

h. la

Home Secretary

Shri A.N. Varma, Principal Secretary to PM

MHA UO No.I/12014/27/93-IS(D.III) dated 9th August, 1994.

TOP SECRET

Prime Minister's Office

Subject: - Controversy regarding Netaji's death and bringing his ashes to India from Japan.

Secretary may kindly refer to his U.O. note I/12014/27/93-IS(D.III) of August 9 on the No. subject.

- The conclusions of the deliberations in the Core Group on this subject, communicated by Home Secretary, were brought to PM's attention.
- 3. PM has directed that the Home Ministry a paper on this subject for the Cabinet's consideration.

(N.K.Sinha) Joint Secretary to PM 15.9.94

Home Secretary No. PMO (NGO) 354/T/94- dt. 16-9-94

Issued. 05 (NOD).

SM (4)

Ministry of External Affairs Joint Secretary(AP)'s Office

TOP SECRET

In Pallus

P.M.O. may please refer to MEA U.O. No.2927-JS(AP)/94 dated 22 August 1994 and also their U.O. Note No.870/11/P/10/93-Pol dated 9th August, 1994 regarding Netaji.

2. Foreign Secretary has directed that a copy of the note below be forwarded to PMO along with a copy of letter No.TOK/102/2/92 dated 27 September, 1994 and its enclosure, received from our Ambassador in Tokyo, for information and record.

(R.S. Kalha) Joint Secretary(AP)

Reun

Ms Sujata Mehta, Director(PMO)
MEA U.O. No. 25 4 NGO

please hick Lun 24.11

Now file is placed below

SO(NGO) 25/11/94

276/13/19/11 21/05)

P. M. O. (NGO)

Dy. No. 447 194

25-11-24

209/Dir(5)/1894

P.5-6 | N

SECRET

Ministry of External Affairs (Asia Pacific Division)

A credible and Detailed explanation from Japanese authorities as to why the cremation certificate was not in Netaji's name is necessary.

(Contention of Shri Ashish Ray)

Position as per our records

There is no information on this issue available in the records. However, two enquiry committees in 1956 (Shah Nawaz) and 1970 (Khosla) examained a large number of files and 224 witnesses (including 100 abroad) and came to the conclusion that Netaji died in the air crash at Taihoku on 18th August, 1945. The Cabinet considered this report and accepted the finding. The report of the Khosla Commission alongwith Memorandum of Action Taken, was laid on Table of both Houses of Parliament on 3rd September, 1974.

2. Report of investigation carried out by Japanese Government in 1956 according to which the death of Netaji was confirmed and the report was handed over to the Indian Government a copy of which exists in files at both the Ministry of External Affairs and in the Indian Embassy, Tokyo.

(Contention of Shri Ashish Ray)

Position as per our records

This report is not available among the records available with the Ministry of External Affairs. Our Mission in Tokyo has also been approached who have also been requested to confirm if they possess a copy of this report.

3. To obtain from Russian authorities, information that Netaji never visited Soviet Union after August 18, 1945 if this is indeed the case.

(Contention of Shri Ashish Ray)

Position as per our records

The Russian Federtaion vide its note No.2/YUA dated January 8, 1992 addressed to the Embassy of India, Moscow, has confirmed in reply to Embassy of India Moscow's Note Verbale of September 16, 1991 to the Russian Government, that as per the records available in the Central and Republican Archives, there is no information about the stay of the former President of Indian National Congress, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in Soviet Union in 1945 and after that.

4. A clarification is required from the British Government on its stand until at least the late 1940's that Netaji did not die in the plane crash.

(Contention of Shri Ashish Ray)

Position as per our records.

There is nothing in records available with us

5. To subject the urn containing the ashes of Netaji into a simple X-ray in order to determine the reported gold plated tooth pertaining to Netaji lying in the urn. In order to establish the genuineness the ashes kept at Renkoji Temple, Japan.

(Contention of Shri Ashish Ray.)

Position as per our records.

C.I. C. (Figgess) Report dated 29.9.45.

No Mention.

C.S.D.I.C. Report No.1156 dt. 31.12.45

On August 23, 1945, B. 1269 in the Company of the cleric and staff major and 3 or 4 other Japanese visited the crematorium when the ashes of Bose were collected and placed in a wooden box specially made for the purpose, B. 1269 was shown a small piece of gold among the ashes which he believes was part of one of Bose's gold teeth. The box containing the ashes was then taken to a Japanese temple in the city, where a religious ceremony was again performed by the cleric.

Before S.N. Khan Committee on 6.4.56

"On the morning of August 21, 1945, I went to the crematorium accompanied by two or three Japanese including the civilian and opened the lock of the incinerator with key which was with me. I was present and I saw the ashes of Netaji's body inside it. We had a wooden urn to collect the ashes. We collected some ashes from the head side, nearest to the door, and placed them in the urn. I remember distinctly that a little piece of gold, which was from the filling of one of Netaji's teeth was removed and placed in the urn."

While no X-ray of the urn has so far been conducted and no records therefore exist, the discrepancy in the date mentioned in the statement of Col. Rahman in CSDIC report and in Shah Nawaz Committee Report under this heading (as reproduced

above) may also be noted which refers to dates being mentioned as divergent as August 23, 1945 and August 21, 1945.

- To the option of irreversible judgement from the Supreme Court authorising return of the ashes, there is already a case before the Chief Justice pertaining how Netaji could have been given Bharat Ratna posthumously. There are no records the suggestion of seeking which deal with irreversible decision from Supreme authorising return of the ashes. Records are however available pertaining to an objection filed in Calcutta High Court challenging the declaration of Bharat Ratna Award given posthumously. It may, however, be also noted here (file C/551/12/93-JP) that GOI has revoked its decision to confer Bharat Ratna on Netaji in January 1994.
- 7. CCPA approved on 27th February, 1991 proposal of MHA that "no useful purpose would be served by holding yet another inquiry or by bringing the ashes back to India at present as this might create unnecessary tensions."

JS(PMO) in his Note on 24.8.1992 stated "PM agrees that the inquiry into the question of whether Netaji is dead or alive or the circumstances of his disappearance, need not be reopened".

Above reiterated in PMO letter of 15.12.92 that "circumstances of Netaji's disappearance need not be re-opened."



SECRET (206 DALAN) (1)
SECRET
SOLELAP OF SILO

Embassy of India, 2-11, Kudan-Minami 2-chome, Chiyoda-ku, TOKYO 102 Telex: 2324886 INDEMB J Phone: 03(3262)2391

hone: 03(3262)2391 Fax: 03(3234)4866

No. TOK/102/2/92

September 27, 1994

Dear Ranjit,

Kindly refer to your letter No. 3379- JS(AP)/94 dated September 16, 1994 regarding Netaji's death.

In response to a query by the Embassy to the Gaimusho, the latter sent a letter dated July 24, 1956 informing that the cremation permit in the name of Mr. Okura is believed to be that of Mr. Subhash Chandra Bose. A copy of Gaimusho's letter dated July 24, 1956, as well as a copy of the death certificate of Mr. Ichiro Okura, is enclosed.

Rugarde.

Yours sincerely,

(Prakash Shah)

Shri R.S. Kalha
Joint Secretary (AP)
Ministry of External Affairs
NEW DELHI

THE GAIMUSHO July 24, 1956 8.80 HILO. Dear Mr. Dar, With reference to your letter No. F.5(1)NGO-I of May 30th, 1956, and my letter dated June 14th, 1956, I wish to inform you that the following reply has been received from Mr. K. Horiuchi, Ambassador of Japan at Taipei, to our enquiry made on this matter: 1. "Doctor's Report" and "Police Report" as mentioned in Mr. Dar's letter could not be traced at Taipei in spite of all efforts. 2. As to "Cremation Permit" a certified copy of the original document on cremation permit which is heldby the Bureau of Health and Hygiene Taipei Municipal Office, could be obtained. The document mentions the name of ICHIRO OKURA as the deceased and that of TANEYOSHI YOSHIMI as the applicant. Since the death of Mr. Subhas Chandra Bose was kept strictly confidential at that time, it is believed that this cremation permit on ICHIRO OKURA must correspond to the case for late Mr. Subhas Chandra Bose. Therefore, I wish to enclose herewith the above-mentioned copy of "Cremation Permit" together with its translation in English. Yours sincerely, Sd/- Hisaji Hattori Chief of 4th Section Asian Affairs Bureau Ministry of Foreign Affairs Mr. A.K.Dar, First Secretary, Embassy of India, Tokyo.

Name of No. Disease Date of Death Date of Permission Date of Cremation

Place of Burial Occupation & Cremation.

Permanent Name of Date of Applicant Sex Domicile Deceased Birth

Name

Present address. Address

2640

2641 Heart Attack

Aug. 19. 1945 Aug. 21, 1945 Aug. 22, 1945

Municipal Non-regular Crematory staff mems ber of Army Forces.

Male

No.1,2-Chome, Ichiro April 9, Unit Taneyoshi | Dogenzaka. Okura 1900. No.21123 Yoshimi Shibuya-ky, Tokyo. No.2,3-chome,

Nogi-machi Taipei City

Examined and authenticated by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

SEAL.

Sd/- Yasutoru Asahina Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, (Archives Section).

It is certified that the above statement, abstracted from the original document on cremation permit, is correct and true.

July 14. 1956.

Bureau of Health & Hygiene, Taipei Municipal Office. (Sealed)

